

Application No: 13/2369M

Location: MOTTRAM HALL HOTEL, WILMSLOW ROAD, MOTTRAM ST ANDREW, MACCLESFIELD, CHESHIRE, SK10 4QT

Proposal: Listed Building Consent For Erection Of A Marquee At Mottram Hall Hotel

Applicant: Mr Andrew O'Brien, DeVere Hotels & Leisure

Expiry Date: 31-Jul-2013

Date Report Prepared: 19 July 2013

SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION

Refuse, due to impact on the on a grade II* Listed Building & setting of Listed Building

MAIN ISSUES

- Impact on grade II* Listed Building

REASON FOR REPORT

The application is for the erection of a temporary (5 year) marquee. Under the Council's Constitution it is required to be determined by the Northern Planning Committee, as it is a grade II* Listed Building.

The proposal is considered to be unacceptable for the reasons set out in the reason for refusal and in the appraisal section of this report.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND CONTEXT

Mottram Hall is a grade II* Listed Building which is in operated by De Vere as a four star hotel, with golf course and spa facilities. The building is set within extensive parkland, and is accessed off Wilmslow Road by a tree lined drive.

Mottram Hall is situated in the village of Mottram St Andrew, which is a rural village located between Wilmslow and Macclesfield. The site is surrounded by Mottram Wood.

The hall itself is two-storey. It has been altered and significantly extended over the years, having recently undergone an extensive refurbishment.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Listed Building Consent is sought for the erection of a temporary (5 year) marquee in the garden directly to the rear of the hall. Access to the marquee would be through a covered walkway from the hall.

The proposed marquee would be capable of accommodating up to 350 people, and it has been designed for use by corporate parties, wedding receptions and charity events. The development would create 694 square metres of floor space.

The marquee is made up of three elements:

- The walkway between the hall and the main structure (22 metres x 3 metres, leading to 5 metres at the main entrance)
- The main structure (35 metres x 12 metres)
- Toileting facilities (12 metres x 6 metres)

The main structure measures 5 metres in height from floor level.

It is proposed that the marquee would be fabricated in a white PVC finish, with white UPVC windows and doors.

RELEVANT HISTORY

- | | |
|----------|---|
| 13195PB | Erection of a three storey extension to provide extra bedroom accommodation, managers flat, staff quarters and construction of extension to car park.
Approved with conditions 15.07.78 |
| 03/0225P | New conference & banqueting facility with link deck over car park to provide 89 additional spaces & associated landscaping & engineering works. Rearrangement of approach & car park. (<i>Listed Building Consent</i>)
Approved with conditions 15.08.05 |
| 07/2322P | Construction of disabled access ramps, external steps and stone pillars with various internal and external alterations.
(<i>Listed Building Consent</i>)
Approved with conditions 16.11.07 |
| 12/2951M | Minor internal alterations to main reception at hotel; alterations to leisure area to provide new floor for spa area, alter and upgrade existing changing facilities; external alterations to access points.
(<i>Listed Building Consent</i>)
Approved with conditions 20.11.12 |
| 13/0188M | Proposed external spa and sauna rooms
(<i>Listed Building consent</i>)
Approved with conditions 20.03.13 |

POLICIES

Macclesfield Borough Local Plan (2004):

BE18 – Alterations to Listed Buildings

BE16 – Impact on setting of Listed Building

Other Material Considerations

The National Planning Policy Framework came into effect on 27 March 2012, and replaces the advice provided in Planning Policy Guidance Notes and Statements. The aim of this document is to make the planning system less complex and more accessible, to protect the environment and to promote sustainable growth.

The saved policies within the Macclesfield Borough Council Local Plan (2004) are still applicable, but should be weighted according to their degree of consistency with the NPPF. The Local Plan policy outlined above is consistent with the NPPF and therefore should be given full weight.

The key section of the NPPF is Conserving and enhancing the historic environment.

CONSULTATIONS (External to Planning)

English Heritage

English Heritage advise that they are unable to support this application. They advise that:

“The significance of Mottram Hall lies largely in its outstanding architectural quality and close relationship with its surviving areas of picturesque style gardens. Listed at grade II, this building is within the top 8% of all Listed Buildings nationally. The site in question (designed landscape directly to the east of the hall) is consistent with the stylistic origins of Mottram Hall and has remained unaltered from at least the mid 19th Century. There is therefore significant potential for this site to be one of the few surviving features of the original garden design, making it a highly important aspect of the setting of this grade II* designated heritage asset.*

The application in its current form would fundamentally disrupt the strong visual and spatial relationship between Mottram Hall and its closely linked designed landscape. Important views between the picturesque landscape and its focal point (the hall) would be lost, as well as deliberately designed views to and from the early 20th Century formal garden to the east. Introducing a building, particularly one of this scale in a picturesque landscape is fundamentally at odds with its rural-style, informal design. For these reasons, the proposal in its current form will be harmful to the significance of this highly designated, national heritage asset”.

APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING INFORMATION

A Planning Statement, Design and Access Statement & Heritage Statement, have been received in support of the application.

OFFICER APPRAISAL

Impact on the Listed Building / setting of the Listed Building

The Conservation Officer recommends that the application be refused on the following grounds:

1. Adverse impact on character and appearance of Listed Building
2. Adverse impact on setting of Listed Building

Concerns are raised in respect of the following matters:

- The marquee will block the main view of the hall from the garden;
- The Listed Building would be obscured by the development;
- Proposal dominates and detracts from the Listed Building;
- The marquee will compromise the setting of the existing Listed Building;
- The walkway structure will not preserve the Listed Building;
- Concern is raised in respect of the positioning, bulk, design and materials, as it is thought they contrast with the hall;
- The current proposal does not enhance the significance of the heritage asset by its design and use of materials;
- The proposal is not of outstanding design nor is it in an appropriate location to warrant an exception to policy;
- There are also questions on how the proposed extension will be constructed and its connections with the listed elements of the building.

There are two key concerns with the proposal, firstly, the structure detracts from the character and appearance of the hall, due to the scale, design and materials being proposed, and secondly, the development has a harmful effect on the setting of this grade II* heritage asset.

Whilst it is recognised that the marquee is temporary, it will cause harm whilst it is in position.

The structure is considered to cause substantial harm to the setting of the Listed Building, which outweighs any public benefit.

Alternative siting?

Following a site meeting with Officers and English Heritage, further information has been provided in respect of alternative sites for the marquee.

Four sites were identified which could accommodate the marquee:

Site A – Land to the west of the front façade of Mottram Hall

Site B – Land to the east of Mottram Hall

Site C- Land to the north east of Mottram Hal

Site D – Land to the east of the rear façade of Mottram Hall (the application site)

Each site was assessed in terms of

a) Sensitivity of the site in heritage and visual terms

- b) Operational constraints
- c) Other material considerations

The applicant determined that site D *“offers the right balance between operational and logistic need of the hotel and the effect of the proposal on the setting of the heritage asset”*.

The Conservation Officer and English Heritage advise that they are grateful for the additional information, which justifies the choice of location, however they remain concerned about the location of the marquee and the aesthetic qualities.

CONCLUSIONS AND REASON(S) FOR THE DECISION

The proposed development is considered to have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of this grade II* heritage asset, and will also harm the setting of the Listed Building, particularly due to the building obscuring important views of the rear of the hall, and disrupting the spatial relationship between the hall and the closely linked designed landscape.

Objections have been received from both English Heritage and the Council's Conservation Officer.

The development is considered to be contrary to both local and national planning policy, and therefore a recommendation of refusal is made.

Application for Listed Building Consent

RECOMMENDATION: Refuse for the following reasons:

1. R02LB - Adverse impact on character and appearance of Listed Building
2. R03LB - Adverse impact on setting of Listed Building

(c) Crown copyright and database rights 2013. Ordnance Survey
100049045, 100049046.

